

APPENDIX I

October 12, 1946

The Honorable

The Secretary of the Interior

Dear Mr. Secretary:

This is in further reply to your letter of March 4, 1946, concerning the transfer of approximately 6,068 acres of land at Makua, Oahu, Territory of Hawaii.

The War Department has determined that it will not be necessary to press the outright transfer of this land to the War Department jurisdiction. There will, however, be a continued need for its intermittent use by the War Department as a maneuver and training area. The very paucity of land which Governor of Hawaii stressed as a reason for the return of this area to the Territory of Hawaii necessitates the retention of certain use rights by the Army. As you know, fairly large army garrisons are maintained on Oahu and their field training is extremely limited by the small size of the island itself and because the intense cultivation of expensive crops has reduced rough training type terrain to a minimum.

A large area of the Island of Oahu for combat training of the post-war garrison is absolutely essential. Such use would not be continuous nor would it be for long periods of time. It is, therefore, believed that the requirements of the War Department and the Territory both can be met by an executive order setting the area aside permanently as a forest reserve and public recreation site with the provision that the War Department be assured maneuver permits for the use of the area for training purposes when required, and that the public will be excluded during maneuvers and training periods. Should any part of the area be leased for grazing purposes the lease should expressly provide that when the area is required for maneuvers and training the lessee will upon appropriate notice remove all cattle from the areas designated by the Army. The anticipated training will involve amphibious operations with naval gun fire support and air artillery support with the use of high explosive ammunition. Consequently, an impact area would have to be set up which would be subject to limited public use only and construction of buildings and other improvements in certain areas would have to be restricted or prohibited. These details can be worked out with Territorial representatives.

The Makua Project involved not only the acquisition of use rights for public land but also the fee acquisition of approximately 165 acres of private land consisting of 18 separate parcels or lots scattered throughout the public area. Condemnation proceedings were instituted against these parcels and the sum of \$21,572.00 (appraised value) was deposited with the court by the War Department in 1943. It is believed that acquisition of these parcels will work to the benefit of both the Territory and the War Department. Existence of private interests in a general area required for combat training will prove to be a source of embarrassment and financial liability to the Federal Government. Permits from the landowners would have to be acquired for each training period

APPENDIX I, continued

and might not always be forthcoming and damage to private buildings and installations and possibly injury to persons would inevitably occur during maneuvers. The War Department is, therefore, continuing its acquisition proceedings for those privately owned parcels of land. The War Department will be willing to issue these tracts on permit to the Department of the Interior subject to the same condition proposed for the presently publicly owned land in order that the Territory may enjoy the benefits of control of the areas as a whole.

Since the proposed restriction by the War Department will interfere with civilian use and enjoyment of the beach and inland areas only for brief periods of the year and will limit grazing only to a minor degree, it is requested that favorable consideration be given the proposals outlined above.

Sincerely yours,

Secretary of War

APPENDIX J

SUBJECT: Makua Training Area Study

1. At the request of the Hawaiian Department, real estate directive No. RE-D2048 was issued by the Chief of Engineers on 21 December 1942 for acquisition of approximately 6,600 acres of land at Makua, Oahu, T.H., for use as a training area. This acquisition was to be accomplished by condemnation of private lands, and transfer of Territorial lands by Governor's executive order.

2. On 17 May 1943- the Territory of Hawaii "to assist in the war effort," granted to the Military Authorities having charge of military operations in Hawaii, a revocable permit for the duration of the war, plus six months, to use and occupy for military purposes approximately 6,600 acres of Territorial land at Makua. The permit provides that, before expiration or relinquishment of the license, the military shall restore the premises to a condition satisfactory to the Commissioner of Public Lands. A copy of this permit, revocable at the discretion of the Commissioner of Public Lands, is attached (Tab A).

3. Territorial revocable permit No. 200 satisfied the immediate requirements of the Army, but since it did not insure continued use by the Army of the Makua Area and did not complete the action directed by the Real Estate directive, the Commanding General, Central Pacific Base Command, by letter dated 22 August 1945 (Tab B), requested the Governor of the Territory of Hawaii to issue an executive order, in compliance with the directive from the Office of the Chief of Engineers, formally transferring permanently the jurisdiction of the War Department, the Territorial lands at Makua.

4. In reply, 26 November 1945 (Tab C), the Governor suggested that the War Department reconsider its decision to acquire the Makua area because of the following considerations:

a. The area in question comprised forest reserve land formerly utilized for grazing and beach park purposes.

b. The public lands on the Island of Oahu had been seriously reduced and the transfer of the Makua area to the Army would take approximately 50% of public lands on the Island of Oahu remaining under Territorial control.

c. Since the inception of plans for the establishment of a military reservation in Makua, other large areas of land had been acquired by the Army.

d. The Makua area provided good fishing and beach areas for recreational purposes. The Governor stated that he felt strongly the lands should be made available to the public again and not permanently removed from their enjoyment.

e. Various federal departments already held or were acquiring more than one-third of the total coast line on the Island of Oahu.

It appears that at about the same time the Governor requested the Secretary of the Interior and the Territorial Delegate in Washington to intervene with the War Department to obtain a deferment of the proposed acquisition of Territorial and private lands.

5. In reply to a radiogram from the War Department, 12 March 1946 (Tab D), citing objections of the Secretary of the Interior to the requested transfer of land in Makua to the War Department, the Commanding General, USAFMIDPAC, on 12 April 1946 sent a letter to the Chief of Engineers containing the following statements:

a. That in view of the representations of the Governor of Hawaii and the Department of the Interior, the case had been restudied and that it was believed that a satisfactory arrangement could be made short of acquisition. A large area on Oahu for combat training of the post-war garrison was essential. Such training would be intermittent and probably for short periods only so that other use of the area could be made when it was not in use by the Army. The proposed use for public recreation could be easily coordinated with Army use, but use for agriculture, homesites, or other purpose of permanent nature would not be feasible.

b. Withdrawal of the Army request for transfer of lands at Makua was approved provided that the area was permanently set aside as a forest reserve and recreation area, that the War Department was given assurance, preferably in the form of a permanent license, that maneuver permits would be granted for use of the area when required and that the public be excluded during training. Should any of the area be leased for grazing, provision would be made for removal by the lessee of all cattle from areas designated by the Army during training. An impact area would have to be set up for firing high explosive shells.

c. The acquisition of private lands in Makua should continue because existence of private interests in the general area required for combat training would be a source of embarrassment and financial liability to the Government. The Territory would benefit from such acquisition since the entire area could be devoted to use by the public. A copy of the letter is attached (Tab E).

6. In a Disposition Form from the Director of Service, Supply and Procurement, dated 24 June 1946, copy attached (Tab F), the Secretary of War directed that action be taken to obtain use-rights only over the Territorial land in Makua, and that a real estate planning report be prepared covering the privately-owned lands, including their locations, extent, and the estimated cost of fee acquisition.

7. Approximately 190 acres have since been acquired by condemnation. These comprise all former private lands in the Makua Training Area.

8. a. In a letter to the Secretary of the Interior dated 12 October 1946 (Tab G), the Secretary of War stated that the War Department had determined that it would not be necessary to press for the outright transfer of Territorial land at Makua to War Department jurisdiction. He further stated, however, that there would be a continued need, and a post-war need, for its intermittent use by the War Department as a maneuver and training area, but that such use would neither be continuous nor for long periods. He stated that should any part of the area be leased for grazing, the lease should provide for the removal by the lessee of cattle from areas designated by the Army when required for training. He stated that the anticipated training would involve amphibious operations,

artillery and air support, and the use of high explosive ammunition. He stated that an impact area would have to be set up and that construction would have to be limited, but that details could be worked out with Territorial representatives.

b. With regard to the acquisition of the private lands in Makua, the Secretary of War stated that it was desirable for both the Territory and the War Department since the War Department would be willing to issue these tracts on permit to the Department of the Interior subject to the same condition proposed for the presently publicly-owned land, in order that the Territory might enjoy the benefits of control of the areas as a whole. It was stated that restriction by the War Department would interfere with civilian use of the Makua area only for brief periods of the year, and would limit grazing only to a minor degree. The Secretary of War requested concurrence of the Secretary of Interior in the proposal outlined.

c. This office has been able to discover no legal record of a reply to the foregoing from the Secretary of the Interior.

9. a. In an indorsement to the District Engineer dated 22 May 1947 (Tab H), this headquarters reiterated the requirement for use of the Makua Training Area and requested that his office reopen negotiations with Territorial officials and initiate appropriate action with the Chief of Engineers to the end that the Territory would agree to maintenance of the Makua Training Area, prohibiting the addition of permanent improvements or construction, and the issuance of a license permitting the use of the area by the Army for tactical and amphibious training involving the firing of land and seaborne weapons whenever necessary. It was stated that the Makua area would not be in constant use by the Army and could be made available for other uses when not needed for training provided no permanent type structures or other obstructions were built in the area and provided control measures were set up to prevent damage claims resulting from use of the impact area by civilians.

b. In subsequent discussions, in meetings of the Governor's Land Use Committee, the Territory took the stand that the desired action could not be consummated until the existing revocable permit had been terminated. In a subsequent meeting of the USARPAC Land Use Board, Mr. Figert of the District Engineer Office was requested by the Chief of Staff, USARPAC, to terminate the existing permit in order to secure the desired maneuver rights.

10. Action by the District Engineer to terminate the existing permit and to secure the desired maneuver rights has been held up because the Territory refused to terminate the existing agreement until the Army removes all unexploded bombs and shells from the area.

11. By secret radio, WAR-96011, dated 31 October 1949 (Tab I), the Department of the Army directed that no further action be taken toward disposal of Makua without further study. Advice was requested regarding nature of disposal action referred to during inspection of Chief of Staff, U.S. Army. Reply dated 2 November 1949 (Tab J), informed the Department of the Army that the Chief of Staff was advised that the Makua Training Area would be disposed of except for retention of maneuver rights when specifically requested by the Army. Agreement was made by former Commanding General when no combat troops were stationed in Hawaii, but execution of a written agreement for disposition

has been delayed by dedudding. It was stated that in view of the fact that combat troops are now training here, action was being initiated to cancel previous oral agreement, obtain permanent maneuver rights and continue present impact area for artillery, Naval gunfire, and air bombardment.

12. In the report of the Military Members to the Governor's Land Use Committee it was stated that the Makua Training Area is urgently required for proper support of the anticipated Army garrison of 16,000. The report contains the only adequate firing range and is needed for realistic training in amphibious operations when naval gunfire and air support are used. It was stated that there was no objection to the use of the area for recreational purposes by the public when training was not in progress so long as the public is excluded from impact area and no construction is permitted which could interfere with the use of the area by the Army. It was recommended that the area acquired in fee by the Army be retained by the services and that the Territory permit the use of Territorial lands in Makua for practice practical and amphibious training as outlined above whenever necessary.

13. G-3, USARPAC, made a reconnaissance of the area and recommended to the Chief of Staff, USARPAC, retention of the area to include the right to fire artillery and infantry heavy weapons into the present impact area. He concurred in the outright release of certain extremely rough portions of the area which are not required for impact areas.

14. By letter dated 23 November (Tab K), the District Engineer was requested to negotiate with the Territory on the following basis to secure for the Army use of the Makua Training Area as indicated on the enclosed map (Tab L).

a. The area outlined in yellow should be released outright since it is not needed by the Army.

b. The area outlined in purple will be dedudded by the Army prior to 31 December 1950 and will then be opened to the public when not required by the Army for training.

c. The Army will have the right to use the area outlined in red permanently as an impact area. The area may be set aside as a forest reserve but the Army may exclude all persons, except employees of the Territorial Board of Agriculture and Forestry who may be specifically authorized to enter the area by the appropriate Army commander. The impact area will be posted as a danger area by the Army.

d. The rights granted to the Army may be granted to the other armed services at the discretion of the Army.

e. The foregoing to be clearly stipulated in any executive order setting aside the area as a forest reserve and to be formalized in a permanent permit from the Territory to the Department of the Army.

f. Public use of the trancts in Makua acquired in fee by the Army will be limited so as not to interfere in any way with training and maneuvers in the area.